



## **General Certificate in Education**

# **A2 History 6041**

## **Alternative Q Unit 5**

# **Mark Scheme**

*2007 examination – June series*

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: [www.aqa.org.uk](http://www.aqa.org.uk)

Copyright © 2007 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

#### COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

## **CRITERIA FOR MARKING GCE HISTORY:**

### **A2 EXAMINATION PAPERS**

#### **General Guidance for Examiners**

---

#### **A: INTRODUCTION**

The AQA's A2 History specification has been designed to be 'objectives-led' in that questions are set which address the assessment objectives published in the Board's specification. These cover the normal range of skills, knowledge and understanding which have been addressed by A2 level candidates for a number of years.

Most questions will address more than one objective reflecting the fact that, at A2 level, high-level historical skills, including knowledge and understanding, are usually deployed together.

The specification has addressed subject content through the identification of 'key questions' which focus on important historical issues. These 'key questions' give emphasis to the view that GCE History is concerned with the analysis of historical problems and issues, the study of which encourages candidates to make judgements grounded in evidence and information.

The schemes of marking for the specification reflect these underlying principles. The mark scheme which follows is of the 'levels of response' type showing that candidates are expected to demonstrate their mastery of historical skills in the context of their knowledge and understanding of History.

Consistency of marking is of the essence in all public examinations. This factor is particularly important in a subject like History which offers a wide choice of subject content options or alternatives within the specification for A2.

It is therefore of vital importance that assistant examiners apply the marking scheme as directed by the Principal Examiner in order to facilitate comparability with the marking of other alternatives.

Before scrutinising and applying the detail of the specific mark scheme which follows, assistant examiners are required to familiarise themselves with the instructions and guidance on the general principles to apply in determining into which level of response an answer should fall (Section B) and in deciding on a mark within a particular level of response (Section C).

**B: EXEMPLIFICATION OF A LEVEL (A2) DESCRIPTORS**

The relationship between the Assessment Objectives (AOs) 1.1, 1.2 and 2 and the Levels of Response.

A study of the generic levels of response mark scheme will show that candidates who operate solely or predominantly in AO 1.1, by writing a narrative or descriptive response, will restrict themselves to a maximum of 6 out of 20 marks by performing at Level 1. Those candidates going on to provide more explanation (AO 1.2), supported by the relevant selection of material (AO1.1), will have access to approximately 6 more marks, performing at Level 2 and low Level 3, depending on how implicit or partial their judgements prove to be. Candidates providing explanation with evaluation and judgement, supported by the selection of appropriate information and exemplification, will clearly be operating in all 3 AOs (AO 2, AO1.2 and AO1.1) and will therefore have access to the highest levels and the full range of 20 marks by performing in Levels 3, 4 and 5.

**Level 1:*****Either***

Is able to demonstrate, by relevant selection of material, implicit understanding of the question. Answers will be predominantly, or wholly narrative.

***Or***

Answer implies analysis but is excessively generalised, being largely or wholly devoid of specific information. Such answers will amount to little more than assertion, involving generalisations which could apply to almost any time and/or place.

**Exemplification/guidance**

Narrative responses will have the following characteristic: they

- will lack direction and any clear links to the analytical demands of the question
- will, therefore, offer a relevant but outline-only description in response to the question
- will be limited in terms of communication skills, organisation and grammatical accuracy.

Assertive responses: at this level, such responses will:

- lack any significant corroboration
- be generalised and poorly focused
- demonstrate limited appreciation of specific content
- be limited in terms of communication skills, organisation and grammatical accuracy.

IT IS MOST IMPORTANT TO DISCRIMINATE BETWEEN THIS TYPE OF RESPONSE AND THOSE WHICH ARE SUCCINCT AND UNDEVELOPED BUT FOCUSED AND VALID (appropriate for Level 2 or above).

---

**Level 2:*****Either***

Demonstrates, by relevant selection of material, some understanding of a range of relevant issues. Most such answers will show understanding of the analytical demands but lack weight and balance.

***Or***

Demonstrates, by relevant selection of material, implicit understanding of a wide range of relevant issues. Most such answers will be dependent on descriptions, but will have valid links.

**Exemplification/guidance**

Narrative responses will have the following characteristics:

- understanding of some but not all of the issues
- some direction and focus demonstrated largely through introductions or conclusions
- some irrelevance and inaccuracy
- coverage of all parts of the question but be lacking in balance
- some effective use of the language, be coherent in structure, but limited grammatically.

Analytical responses will have the following characteristics:

- arguments which have some focus and relevance
- an awareness of the specific context
- some accurate but limited factual support
- coverage of all parts of the question but be lacking in balance
- some effective use of language, be coherent in structure, but limited grammatically.

**Level 3:**

Demonstrates by selection of appropriate material, explicit understanding of a range of issues relevant to the question. Judgement, as demanded by the question, may be implicit or partial.

**Exemplification/guidance**

Level 3 responses will be characterised by the following:

- the approach will be generally analytical but may include some narrative passages which will be limited and controlled
- analysis will be focused and substantiated, although a complete balance of treatment of issues is not to be expected at this level nor is full supporting material
- there will be a consistent argument which may, however, be incompletely developed, not fully convincing or which may occasionally digress into narrative
- there will be relevant supporting material, although not necessarily comprehensive, which might include reference to interpretations
- effective use of language, appropriate historical terminology and coherence of style.

**Level 4:**

Demonstrates by selection of a wide range of precisely selected material, explicit understanding of the demands of the question and provides a consistently analytical response to it. Judgement, as demanded by the question, will be explicit but may be limited in scope.

**Exemplification/guidance**

Answers at this level have the following characteristics:

- sustained analysis, explicitly supported by relevant and accurate evidence
- little or no narrative, usually in the form of exemplification
- coverage of all the major issues, although there may not be balance of treatment
- an attempt to offer judgement, but this may be partial and in the form of a conclusion or summary
- effective skills of communication through the use of accurate, fluent and well directed prose.

**Level 5:**

As Level 4 but also shows appropriate conceptual awareness which, together with the selection of a wide range of precisely selected evidence, offers independent and effectively sustained judgement appropriate to the full demands of the question.

**Exemplification/guidance**

Level 5 will be differentiated from Level 4 in that there will be:

- a consistently analytical approach
- consistent corroboration by reference to selected evidence
- a clear and consistent attempt to reach judgements
- some evidence of independence of thought, but not necessarily of originality
- a good conceptual understanding
- strong and effective communication skills, grammatically accurate and demonstrating coherence and clarity of thought.

---

**C: DECIDING ON MARKS WITHIN A LEVEL**

***These principles are applicable to both the Advanced Subsidiary examination and to the A level (A2) examination.***

Good examining is, ultimately, about the **consistent application of judgement**. Mark schemes provide the necessary framework for exercising that judgement but it cannot cover all eventualities. This is especially so in subjects like History, which in part rely upon different interpretations and different emphases given to the same content. One of the main difficulties confronting examiners is: "What precise mark should I give to a response *within* a level?". Levels may cover four, five or even six marks. From a maximum of 20, this is a large proportion. In making a decision about a specific mark to award, it is vitally important to think *first* of the mid-range within the level, where the level covers more than two marks. Comparison with other candidates' responses **to the same question** might then suggest that such an award would be unduly generous or severe.

In making a decision away from the middle of the level, examiners should ask themselves several questions relating to candidate attainment, **including the quality of written communication skills**. The more positive the answer, the higher should be the mark awarded. We want to avoid "bunching" of marks. Levels mark schemes can produce regression to the mean, which should be avoided.

So, is the response:

- precise in its use of factual information?
- appropriately detailed?
- factually accurate?
- appropriately balanced, or markedly better in some areas than in others?
- and, **with regard to the quality of written communication skills:**  
generally coherent in expression and cogent in development (as appropriate to the level awarded by organising relevant information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary and terminology)?
- well-presented as to general quality of language, i.e. use of syntax (including accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar)? (In operating this criterion, however, it is important to avoid "double jeopardy". Going to the bottom of the mark range for a level in each part of a structured question might well result in too harsh a judgement. The overall aim is to mark positively, giving credit for what candidates know, understand and can do, rather than looking for reasons to reduce marks.)

It is very important that Assistant Examiners **do not** always start at the lowest mark within the level and look for reasons to increase the level of reward from the lowest point. This will depress marks for the alternative in question and will cause problems of comparability with other question papers within the same specification.

---

**June 2007**

**Alternative Q: Britain, 1815–1914**

**A2 Unit 5: Britain, 1841–1914**

**Question 1**

(a) Use **Sources A** and **B** and your own knowledge.

To what extent do these sources agree on Gladstone's approach to foreign policy?

(10 marks)

*Target: AO1.1, AO1.2*

- L1: Extracts simple statements from the sources or refers to own knowledge to demonstrate agreement/disagreement on the issue/event which is the subject of debate. **1-2**
- L2: Demonstrates explicit understanding of aspects of agreement/disagreement on the issue/event which is the subject of debate, with reference to either sources and/or own knowledge. **3-5**
- L3: Demonstrates explicit understanding of similarity and difference of interpretation in relation to the debate and offers some explanation. **6-8**
- L4: Uses appropriately selected material, from both sources and own knowledge, to reach a sustained judgement on the extent of similarity and difference in interpretation in relation to the debate. **9-10**

**Indicative content**

The sources both suggest that Gladstone wanted to avoid conflict and saw negotiation as the best method to offer the world as an example. Source B suggests Gladstone had little choice whereas Source A suggests a tougher stance would have been more popular. Own knowledge regarding the Gladstonian Liberal insistence upon a moral foreign policy can be used to develop these points. Gladstone's philosophy related, in Source B, to his overall desire to keep military expenditure down. Own knowledge may be used here to refer to the strong pacifist element on the Liberal back benches. The unpopularity of supporting France may be linked back to the legacy of problems encountered in the Crimea or the success of Bismarck in making it appear to the world that France was the aggressor.

(b) Use **Sources A, B and C** and your own knowledge.

To what extent was Gladstone more successful than Disraeli in protecting British interests in response to international issues? (20 marks)

*Target: AO1.1, AO1.2, AO2*

- L1: Is able to demonstrate, by relevant selection of material, *either* from the sources *or* from own knowledge, implicit understanding of the question. Answers will be predominantly, or wholly, narrative. **1-6**
- L2: ***Either***  
 Demonstrates, by relevant selection of material, *either* from the sources *or* from own knowledge, some understanding of a range of relevant issues. Most such answers will show understanding of the analytical demands but will lack weight and balance.
- Or***  
 Demonstrates, by relevant selection of material, *both* from the sources *and* from own knowledge, implicit understanding of a wide range of relevant issues. These answers, while relevant, will lack both range and depth and will contain some assertion. **7-11**
- L3: Is able to demonstrate, by relevant selection of material, *both* from the sources *and* from own knowledge, explicit understanding of the issues relevant to the question. Judgement, as demanded by the question, may be implicit or partial. **12-15**
- L4: Demonstrates, by selection of a wide range of precisely selected material, *both* from the sources *and* from own knowledge, explicit understanding of the demands of the question and provides a consistently analytical response to it. Judgement, as demanded by the question, will be explicit but may be limited in scope. **16-18**
- L5: As L4, but also shows appropriate conceptual awareness which, together with a selection of a wide range of precisely selected evidence, offers independent and effectively sustained judgement appropriate to the full demands of the question. **19-20**

### Indicative content

The sources offer support for Gladstone which may not be so well reflected in students' own knowledge. The unglamorous nature of Gladstone's foreign policy was heavily attacked by Disraeli who in turn was flailed by Gladstone as immoral and profligate, especially when the Ashanti War created a budget deficit under Disraeli. Disraeli's successes over the Suez Canal and making Victoria an Empress are likely to feature alongside varying estimations of Disraeli's success at the Congress of Berlin. However, others will argue that Disraeli's flamboyant policies were achieved without raising taxes to cover them and therefore looked better than they deserved to. The question draws only on the material laid out in the specification and so it relates to the years 1869–1880.

**Question 2**

- (a) Use **Sources A** and **B** and your own knowledge.

To what extent do these sources agree on the reasons why the Conservative Party opposed the Liberal government of 1906–1914? (10 marks)

*Target: AO1.1, AO1.2*

- L1: Extracts simple statements from the sources or refers to own knowledge to demonstrate agreement/disagreement on the issue/event which is the subject of debate. **1-2**
- L2: Demonstrates explicit understanding of aspects of agreement/disagreement on the issue/event which is the subject of debate, with reference to either sources and/or own knowledge. **3-5**
- L3: Demonstrates explicit understanding of similarity and difference of interpretation in relation to the debate and offers some explanation. **6-8**
- L4: Uses appropriately selected material, from both sources and own knowledge, to reach a sustained judgement on the extent of similarity and difference in interpretation in relation to the debate. **9-10**

**Indicative content**

Both sources agree that the Conservatives opposed reforms put forward by the Liberal Government and that part of this opposition arose from anti-Irish sentiment. However, Source A focuses upon the more narrow opposition by the Conservative-dominated Lords to measures affecting land, whereas Source B widens the view to property in general. Source B also develops the issue with relation to the Parliament Act and the way in which that opens the way to Home Rule. This can be substantiated by own knowledge on the situation relating to the constitutional crisis of 1910–1912. The reference to Irish land in Source A links well to Source B saying that the Conservatives in the Lords had the power to decide which measures they could oppose, i.e. that the Conservatives saw themselves as the ultimate rulers of the country regardless of the party balance in the Commons.

- (b) Use **Sources A, B** and **C** and your own knowledge.

‘The greatest domestic challenge faced by the Liberal government was the House of Lords.’

How valid is this view of the domestic political and social difficulties faced by the Liberal government of 1906–1914?

In your answer, you are not expected to refer to events in Ireland. (20 marks)

*Target: AO1.1, AO1.2, AO2*

- L1: Is able to demonstrate, by relevant selection of material, *either* from the sources *or* from own knowledge, implicit understanding of the question. Answers will be predominantly, or wholly, narrative. **1-6**

**L2: *Either***

Demonstrates, by relevant selection of material, *either* from the sources *or* from own knowledge, some understanding of a range of relevant issues. Most such answers will show understanding of the analytical demands but will lack weight and balance.

***Or***

Demonstrates, by relevant selection of material, *both* from the sources *and* from own knowledge, implicit understanding of a wide range of relevant issues. These answers, while relevant, will lack both range and depth and will contain some assertion. **7-11**

**L3:** Is able to demonstrate, by relevant selection of material, *both* from the sources *and* from own knowledge, explicit understanding of the issues relevant to the question. Judgement, as demanded by the question, may be implicit or partial. **12-15**

**L4:** Demonstrates, by selection of a wide range of precisely selected material, *both* from the sources *and* from own knowledge, explicit understanding of the demands of the question and provides a consistently analytical response to it. Judgement, as demanded by the question, will be explicit but may be limited in scope. **16-18**

**L5:** As L4, but also shows appropriate conceptual awareness which, together with a selection of a wide range of precisely selected evidence, offers independent and effectively sustained judgement appropriate to the full demands of the question. **19-20**

**Indicative content**

This question should enable candidates to provide a structured response around the major political and social challenges faced by the Liberal Government. The opposition of the House of Lords is reflected in Sources A and B as in the resulting Parliament Act. Source C brings in the opposition from organised labour and particularly key unions such as the dockers, railwaymen and miners. The Liberals found it difficult to maintain middle class support by maintaining law and order whilst holding on to working class support which increasingly looked to Labour. From own knowledge, candidates can bring in the problems faced over the women's suffrage movement and the pressure for more radical reforms at a time of social unrest. Some may argue that the House of Lords was the greatest challenge because, as Source B shows, it was the vehicle for permanent Tory control. Others may argue that in the long term Source C reveals the greatest threat to the Liberal Party – the rise of Labour.

---

**Section B**

Questions 3-12 are synoptic in nature and the rewarding of candidates' responses should be clearly linked to the range of factors or issues covered in the generic A2 Levels of Response mark scheme and by the indicative content in the specific mark scheme for each question.

**Standard Mark Scheme for Essays at A2 (without reference to sources)**

*Target: AO1.1, AO1.2, AO2*

**L1: *Either***

Is able to demonstrate, by relevant selection of material, implicit understanding of the question. Answers will be predominantly, or wholly, narrative.

***Or***

Answer implies analysis, but is excessively generalised, being largely or wholly devoid of specific information. Such responses will amount to little more than assertion, involving generalisations which could apply to almost any time and/or place. **1-6**

**L2: *Either***

Demonstrates, by relevant selection of material, some understanding of a range of relevant issues. Most such answers will show understanding of the analytical demands, but will lack weight and balance.

***Or***

Demonstrates, by selection of appropriate material, implicit understanding of a range of relevant issues. Most such answers will be dependent on descriptions, but will have valid links. **7-11**

**L3:** Demonstrates, by selection of appropriate material, explicit understanding of a range of issues relevant to the question. Judgement, as demanded by the question, may be implicit or partial. **12-15**

**L4:** Demonstrates, by selection of a wide range of precisely selected material, explicit understanding of the demands of the question and provides a consistently analytical response to it. Judgement, as demanded by the question, will be explicit but may be limited in scope. **16-18**

**L5:** As L4, but also shows appropriate conceptual awareness which, together with the selection of a wide range of precisely selected evidence, offers independent and effectively sustained judgement appropriate to the full demands of the question. **19-20**

---

**Question 3**

'Peel's tariff reforms were a greater success than his other domestic reforms.'  
How valid is this view? (20 marks)

Use standard mark schemes for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6      L2: 7-11      L3: 12-15      L4: 16-18      L5: 19-20**

**Indicative content**

The question focuses on Peel's successes. Peel's tariff reforms are generally held to have laid the foundations for mid-Victorian prosperity and therefore Gladstone's work as Vice-President of the Board of Trade can be counted as one of the ministry's greatest achievements. The principle of Free Trade, which was enshrined in the repeal of the Corn Laws, became the dominant maxim for nearly a hundred years. Candidates are likely to point to the boom in trade and reduction in unemployment reflected in the failure of Chartism. However, others may point to the Budget of 1841 or the 1844 Companies Act or his ability to defuse unrest in Ireland to counter the view put forward in the quotation. Some candidates may challenge the tariff reforms being a success on the grounds that they split the Conservative Party.

**Question 4**

'The failure of Chartism was due to improved economic conditions rather than the movement's own lack of unity.'  
How valid is this view? (20 marks)

Use standard mark scheme for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6      L2: 7-11      L3: 12-15      L4: 16-18      L5: 19-20**

**Indicative content**

Those who see Chartism as a Knife and Fork movement will support the first part of the quotation whilst those who see it as a confused and disparate movement will support the latter. The economic reforms introduced by Peel led to an economic recovery which is paralleled by a decline in agitation by Chartists, to the extent that Chartism fails to successfully resurrect itself even in the emblematic year of 1848. However, some will argue that the key to the failure of Chartism lay in the divisions which separated the "moral force" Chartists from the "physical force" Chartists which eventually led to a loss of the middle class support which would have been vital in influencing parliament. Stronger candidates may take the view that other factors such as the role of the government in countering Chartism were vital or that the six points of the Charter were so unrealistic as to be unobtainable.

---

**Question 5**

'Peel created the "Mid-Victorian Boom" by introducing free trade and Disraeli killed it by keeping free trade.'

How valid is this view?

(20 marks)

Use standard mark scheme for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6**

**L2: 7-11**

**L3: 12-15**

**L4: 16-18**

**L5: 19-20**

**Indicative content**

Peel may be said to have created the Mid-Victorian Boom with his repeal of the Corn Laws and his tariff reductions of 1841–1846. The importance of the Bank Charter Act, Companies Act and Railway Act are likely to feature as supporting evidence for the proposition. Peel's significance may be questioned, however, by reference to the broader economic trends which meant that Britain at the time enjoyed a comparative economic advantage to major potential rivals by the continuing political instability of France, the absence of a united Germany and the outbreak of the American Civil War in 1861. The creation of a united Germany in 1871 and the ending of civil war in the United States may be used to exonerate Disraeli but his belated commitment to Free Trade in 1872 may be seen as hamstringing his policies in office at a time when Bismarck was responding to a similar economic crisis by introducing tariffs in 1878 leading to a further decline in markets for British exports. Disraeli also became focused upon foreign policy and may be criticised for seeking to distract voters from the key issues whilst other candidates may echo Gladstone's condemnation of Disraeli's profligacy in public spending.

**Question 6**

'The extension of the franchise had more impact on the party system than it had on the development of parliament.'

How valid is this view of the consequences of the reform acts of 1867 and 1883–1885?

(20 marks)

Use standard mark scheme for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6**

**L2: 7-11**

**L3: 12-15**

**L4: 16-18**

**L5: 19-20**

**Indicative content**

Since both stages of parliamentary reform are required, candidates only dealing with one should be restricted to the top of Level 2, depending upon the overall quality. Candidates are likely to offer mixed views on the extension of the franchise as in 1867 the increased electorate came largely in urban areas (modified somewhat by Disraeli's redistribution), whereas in 1884 the extension of the franchise was in the countryside. The development of political party organisation in response to the wider franchise should then be contrasted with the limited

impact upon the structure of parliament. Stronger candidates may point to the impact of Irish obstruction as indicating how little impact reform had in comparison. Other candidates may point to the number of titled Cabinet ministers in Gladstone's government or his decision to appoint Chamberlain only to those posts related to business or to Disraeli's appointment of W H Smith to the Cabinet.

### Question 7

'Gladstone's Irish policies were more successful in the Second Ministry, 1880–1885, than in his First Ministry, 1869–1874.'

How valid is this view?

(20 marks)

Use standard mark scheme for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6**

**L2: 7-11**

**L3: 12-15**

**L4: 16-18**

**L5: 19-20**

### Indicative content

This question looks at the strengths and weaknesses of Gladstone's Irish policy by comparing his two ministries. During his first ministry Gladstone largely succeeded in religious policy by passing the amended version of the Irish Church Disestablishment Act but was less effective in dealing with the land question through the 1870 Land Act. In his second ministry he was able to pass the more successful 1881 Land Act but was forced to adopt a policy of coercion in the face of Nationalist violence. The so-called 'Kilmainham Treaty' (1882) can be seen as a pragmatic step or as a humiliation whilst the failure of the 1873 University Bill may be used to criticise Gladstone or to put the blame on intractable Irish attitudes. Gladstone's 'conversion' to Home Rule in 1885 may be seen as evidence that ultimately both ministries were unsuccessful.

### Question 8

'Anti-Catholicism, rather than support for lower taxes, was the key to Conservative success in the years 1885 to 1905.'

How valid is this view?

(20 marks)

Use standard mark scheme for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6**

**L2: 7-11**

**L3: 12-15**

**L4: 16-18**

**L5: 19-20**

### Indicative content

In Lancashire, where Lord Derby, a Freemason, held sway and Birmingham, where the unitarian Chamberlain had a firm grip, the Conservatives and Unionists were able to benefit from popular anti-Catholicism linked to fears of immigration and downward pressure on wages. However, it can also be argued that the Conservatives were the beneficiaries of the 1885 Redistribution Act, since the new suburban seats returned Tories as the Liberals were seen as

likely to raise taxes. The Conservatives appealed to these 'Villa Tories' by opposing costly social reforms which meant taxes could be kept lower. The Conservatives also managed to 'wrap themselves in the flag' due to the legacy of Disraelian 'popular imperialism' which they contrasted with the weakness of Gladstone, e.g. over the Death of Gordon. Anti-Catholicism may also be linked in broad terms to opposition to Irish Home Rule which was seen as a 'catholic' demand.

### Question 9

'Events in Ireland were more important than events in Britain in leading to the crisis over Home Rule in the summer of 1914.'

How valid is this view?

(20 marks)

Use standard mark schemes for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6**

**L2: 7-11**

**L3: 12-15**

**L4: 16-18**

**L5: 19-20**

### Indicative content

This question centres around the relative importance of the pressures within Ireland versus the political pressure within England and the apparent reluctance of Asquith to tackle the issue of Home Rule decisively. Events in Ireland such as: Covenant Day, gun running at Larne, the formation of the UVF and the ICA and the preparations by Ulster protestants to declare independence offer plenty of material to argue for the proposition. Bonar Law's decision to commit the Tory Party to all out opposition and the subsequent passing of the Parliament Act as well as Liberal reliance on support from Labour and the Irish Nationalists after 1910 can be used to counter the proposition.

### Question 10

'Tariff reform divided the Conservatives and united the Liberals.'

How valid is this explanation of the Liberal landslide victory in the 1906 General Election?

(20 marks)

Use standard mark schemes for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6**

**L2: 7-11**

**L3: 12-15**

**L4: 16-18**

**L5: 19-20**

### Indicative content

Whilst candidates will agree with the proposition they need to address 'how valid' in each case. Tariff Reform was not the only issue, others include education and Chinese slavery, and so candidates need to evaluate the relative importance of these issues. They also need to consider whether these issues explain the 'landslide' and so factors such as the Lib-Lab Pact and the electoral system come into play and stronger candidates will link this with the

conservative vote being divided between Free Fooders and Chamberlainites and may point to the survival of Tory seats in the West Midlands owing more to the strength of Liberal Unionism in the region than a desire to see a dear loaf.

### Question 11

'Under Lord Lansdowne war with Germany was merely a possibility but when Lord Grey became Foreign Secretary war was more likely.'

How valid is this view?

(20 marks)

Use standard mark schemes for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6**

**L2: 7-11**

**L3: 12-15**

**L4: 16-18**

**L5: 19-20**

### Indicative content

The proposition follows the view put forward by Charmley that it was the arrival of Lord Grey at the Foreign Office which was the fundamental turning point in British foreign policy because Grey allowed the discussions with France to go beyond the terms set by Lansdowne. However, candidates need to consider whether the decision to sign the Anglo-Japanese Treaty in 1902 was not in fact the first major step in the re-orientation of British foreign policy and therefore the more revolutionary step. The treaty with Japan allowed the British to concentrate more of their navy in Home waters to counter the threat from Germany. The subsequent naval talks with France, supported by the Conservative Foreign Secretary, Lord Lansdowne, can be seen as simply building upon this policy through the division of responsibilities in the Mediterranean. Chamley sees the treaty with Russia in 1907 as a result of Grey's continued focus on Germany as the real enemy and this is supported by the famous memorandum of Sir Eyre Crowe. Lord Salisbury felt Lansdowne had made a fundamental shift in policy by entering into the Entente with France; however, under Salisbury, relations with Russia had always remained strained, so Grey's decision to protect the Empire in this way was a real innovation in policy and put Britain on a collision course with Germany.

---

**Question 12**

'In the years 1880 to 1914, the status of women changed economically and socially rather than politically.'

How valid is this view?

(20 marks)

Use standard mark schemes for essays at A2 (*without* reference to sources).

Marks as follows:

**L1: 1-6**

**L2: 7-11**

**L3: 12-15**

**L4: 16-18**

**L5: 19-20**

**Indicative content**

The denial of the parliamentary franchise to women is a key point in supporting the proposition that they did not see their political status rise in this period, but that would ignore the extent to which public opinion had begun to change. If estimates that half of the pre-war Liberal cabinet agreed with votes for women are accurate then the status of women was rising in at least some quarters. The proposition also ignores the impact women had at a local level following the passage of their enfranchisement for parish councils in 1893. Stronger answers are likely to point out that it was only middle class or wealthier women who saw their status rise in this way. The growing number of what feminist historians refer to as 'white blouse' jobs and the spread of educational opportunities for middle class girls helps to demonstrate their improved status, but legislation still prevented them from entering the traditional professions. In the textile industry women formed a major component in the new unions, but these were still led by men. Some candidates will argue that working class women and those at the top of the social scale probably experienced the least change.