

# **General Certificate of Education June 2013**

Classical Civilisation 1021
Women in Athens and Rome
AS Unit 1D

## **Final**

Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2013 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

#### COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered schools and colleges for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to schools and colleges to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the schools and colleges.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

#### INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.** 

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the student uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

#### **DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE**

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- · read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of students after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Students are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

#### **QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION**

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the student's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

#### LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

accurate knowledge to support it.

#### Level 4 **Demonstrates** accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question clear understanding of central aspects of the question ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has 9-10 an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. Level 3 **Demonstrates** a range of accurate and relevant knowledge some understanding of some aspects of the question some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the 6-8 some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. Level 2 Demonstrates either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or 3-5 some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them. Level 1 **Demonstrates** either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge or 1-2 an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no

#### LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

#### Level 5 Demonstrates

- well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question
- coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question
- · ability to sustain an argument which

has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail.

19-20

has a clear structure

reaches a reasoned conclusion

is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and

makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

#### Level 4 Demonstrates

- generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question
- understanding of many of the central aspects of the question
- · ability to develop an argument which

appropriate.

has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail and has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when

14-18

#### Level 3 Demonstrates

- a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- some understanding of some aspects of the question
- some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question

 some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar

• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

#### Level 2 Demonstrates

- either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them

• and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

5-8

1-4

9-13

#### Level 1 Demonstrates

- either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge
- or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it
- **and** little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

#### LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

#### Level 5 Demonstrates

- well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question
- coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question
- · ability to sustain an argument which

has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail.

27-30

has a clear structure

reaches a reasoned conclusion

is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and

makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

#### Level 4 Demonstrates

- generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question
- understanding of many of the central aspects of the question
- ability to develop an argument which

appropriate.

has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when

20-26

#### Level 3 Demonstrates

- · a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- some understanding of some aspects of the question
- some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question

some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar

13-19

• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

#### Level 2 Demonstrates

- either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them

7-12

1-6

• and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

#### Level 1 Demonstrates

- either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge
- **or** an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it

 and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

Diagologi Olvillogilori 7 (Q)	COL Mark Concine 2010 0	ranc series		
	This page has	s been left intentio	nally blank	

#### Mark Scheme

#### Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

#### Section 1

#### Option A

#### 01 What public honour did Cornelia receive?

(bronze) statue / 'Mother of the Gracchi' (1)

(1 mark)

## 02 Describe the circumstances in which Cornelia's husband died, according to Plutarch in another passage. Make three points.

**THREE** of **e.g.** snakes in bed (1) soothsayers said Tiberius would die if killed male (1) Cornelia would die if killed female (1) Tiberius killed male / let female go (1) because loved wife (1) and she was younger (1) leaving her (12) children to bring up (1) etc.

(3 marks)

#### 03 Give one detail of Cornelia's life in old age.

**ONE** of **e.g.** bore misfortunes nobly / magnanimously / stoically / without weeping (1) told stories about father (Scipio Africanus) / sons as if ancient heroes of Rome (1) lived at Misenum (1) entertained friends / Greeks / learned men (1) exchanged gifts with kings (1) refused Ptolemy's proposal of marriage / remained *univira* (1) considered by some to have lost her mind (1) etc.

(1 mark)

## To what extent do you think the letter in the passage increases, or reduces, Cornelia's reputation? Give the reasons for your views.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- devotion to son, family and state
- encouragement to Gaius to do what is morally right both for state and family
- presents Cornelia as politically conservative in line with ancestors rather than as mother of revolutionaries
- literate and rhetorical in line with her association with learned men
- emotional / passionate? in contradiction to her reputation for stoical fortitude
- domineering ('you should count it a sin to take any major step against my wishes')
- sees Gaius' actions as 'ruining our country' (in contrast to admiration for father Scipio Africanus for defeating Hannibal) and reputation of whole family (rhetorical appeal 'will our family ever cease from madness?')
- presents Cornelia as very much politically engaged in contrast to the impression of detachment given by Plutarch
- ? some sense of emotional blackmail with major emphasis on Gaius' filial duty towards her
- admission of pain caused by those who murdered Tiberius in contrast to what Plutarch savs
- if genuine, letter exceptional example of a female voice; if (as more likely) spurious, still
  marks out Cornelia as extraordinary in that assumed she could have written such a letter
  etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

## 105 In the Republican period, how much independence did Roman women have? Give the reasons for your views.

#### You might include discussion of

- the debate about the Oppian Law
- Turia
- Murdia
- Sempronia
- Clodia.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- debate about Oppian Law: women act independently in staging protest; Cato outraged, believing women should not conduct any business without guardian in accordance with tradition and should not meddle in public affairs, fearing their desire to dominate and be extravagant, and claiming law necessary to curb female instincts because husbands could not otherwise do it; Valerius wins debate by praising occasions on which women have acted independently for benefit of state (Sabines, Coriolanus, Gauls, Idaean Mother, Hannibal all crises), arguing women deserve fruits of victory as much as men and should not be criticised for intervening in matters which affect them, agreeing with Cato women should not normally act independently in men's world but claiming women have lived for centuries to highest standards without compulsion of law and women enjoy being under control of men, who should show respect in exercising authority, not mastery, over women etc.
- Turia: parents murdered and husband abroad / in exile; in these exceptional
  circumstances Turia in eulogy praised for showing independence in prosecuting parents'
  murderers, ensuring father's will upheld, hiding husband, ensuring his well-being in exile
  and his safe return despite brutish treatment by Lepidus and defending home against
  Milo as in all cases demonstrated exceptional devotion; her independent plan to secure a
  legitimate heir despite her infertility appreciated as act of devotion but hotly rejected etc.
- Murdia: in fragmentary eulogy praised for judiciousness in legacies etc.
- Sempronia: used by Sallust as example of Rome's moral decline; out of husband's control and lacking traditional virtues of frugality and chastity, meddled in public affairs and aided Catiline's revolution etc.
- Clodia: in Cicero's malicious portrayal, enhanced by adopting theatrical personae to
  entertain jury, criticises not so much independence in itself but terrible choices she made,
  in Appius Claudius Caecus' more authoritarian view bringing dishonour on family and
  misusing all his achievements because not constrained by example of her forebears, in
  Clodius' more liberal view perversely persisting in pursuing a lover who rejected her etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

#### Option B

What did the men in Passage A find when they visited Lucretia and the other wives? Make two points.

**TWO** of **e.g.** other women banqueting (1) Lucretia working at wool (1) with maids (1) by lamplight (1) in *atrium* (1)

(2 marks)

07 In Passage B, what relation was Fannia to Arria?

granddaughter (1)

(1 mark)

08 How did Arria deal with her son's death? Give two details.

**TWO** of **e.g.** arranged funeral without husband knowing (1) pretended to husband son alive / well (1) hid grief / cried only outside husband's room (1)

(2 marks)

09 'Lucretia's death was far more praiseworthy than Arria's.' To what extent do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.** 

- Lucretia: after appalling act of violence to which youthful Lucretia had only capitulated because of Tarquinius' threat to destroy her honour in way which would have prevented truth being known; Lucretia's clear-headedness and calmness in summoning father and husband to tell all and then, having secured their revenge (and foundation of republic), despite their protestations of her innocence, plunging dagger she had hidden in dress into her breast both to pay penalty even though absolved herself from guilt and for benefit of future Romans so that no woman could use her as example to live unchastely etc.
- Arria: being of a certain age, had shown determination to die for long time, claiming would want her daughter to die with husband and 'You can make me die painfully but you cannot stop me from dying' as knocked herself unconscious on wall; Pliny admits suicide with words 'Paetus, it doesn't hurt' noble in being consolation and example, but says 'immortality was before her eyes' (and she too was implicated in plot and, after confiscation of Paetus' property, would have had a much reduced lifestyle) etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

10 To what extent do Livy and Pliny use women to make moral points and to what extent do they have other reasons for writing about them? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- Livy's accounts of the Sabine women, Lucretia, Cloelia, and the debate about the repeal of the Oppian Law
- Pliny's letters about Calpurnia, Minicia Marcella, the Helvidiae sisters, Arria, and Fannia.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.** 

- whether re-telling legends or giving historical narrative, Livy had moral purpose in line with Roman and family values Augustus promoting, but also concerned to dramatise, bring past to life etc.
  - o legend of Sabine women part of foundation myth of Rome, told to show inter alia early greatness of Roman manhood, a mongrel bunch, whose only weakness was its inability to reproduce until allied to other Italians, the proper female response to these male requirements including submission to deceit and violence if in interests of Rome, importance of child-rearing and obedience in return for respect from husbands etc.; much patronising of women in words Livy attributes to Romulus and other men, but creates vivid, memorable narrative etc.
  - Lucretia part of foundation myth of Republic, treated as exemplum of ideal matrona, a prize-winning wife who shows unparalleled diligence, courage, duty, honour, chastity etc.; motivated at all times by best interests of family and Rome, who without question accepts view that one's life / death should be example to others and aware that through her actions she can have a political as well as moral impact; not merely submissive but takes initiative with positive outcomes etc.; legend dramatically retold with colourful detail and direct speech to point contrast between innocence and corruption etc.
  - Livy (with some patronising comments and well-chosen narrative detail) emphasises novelty of Cloelia's behaviour and its commemoration, her extreme bravery, intelligence and sense of duty towards Rome despite youth and sex – qualities so egregious that recognised even by enemy king etc.
  - Oppian Law: set piece worked up and pared down by Livy to show two representative and (in his eyes) polarised speeches with conflicting views about the proper behaviour and treatment of Roman women, in own time as much as in 2<sup>nd</sup> century BC; recreates drama of situation as well as vividness of debate etc.
- Pliny writing letters with a view to publication to demonstrate his own credentials as upper-class Roman male, make quasi-philosophical points, consolidate his relationship with other prominent Roman families and show off his literary skills etc.
  - Calpurnia: stresses her chastity, devotion, respect, frugality as inculcated by aunt; praises her discreet interest in his legal career and literary efforts, both of which reflect well on his glory; some awkwardness in letter to grandfather about miscarriage but emphasis on her ability to conceive to continue outstanding family line; allusions to love poetry in descriptions of his behaviour when she is absent convalescing etc.
  - Minicia Marcella: in quasi-eulogy, portrayed as having all qualities of matrona despite youth, all of which uses to support family interests and reflect excellence of father – wisdom, modesty, studiousness, endurance in illness; purpose of letter to confirm bond with father, demonstrate his own insights into how to handle grief etc.
  - Helvidiae: emphasis on their fertility and its tragic consequences as well as reaffirming Pliny's ties to family etc.
  - Arria: as passage, to illustrate (perhaps paradoxical) observation that actions for which one is famed are not necessarily one's most noble; again to consolidate links with this previously dissident family by praising Arria's Stoicism in its various manifestations etc.
  - Fannia: in letter expressing personal grief for member of family to which Pliny again wants to reaffirm his ties, stresses her extreme devotion to husband Helvidius in opposition to earlier emperor, care for Vestal Junia and endurance in facing illness, with some phrases that might be spoken in a eulogy etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

#### Section 2

#### **Option C**

'Athenian men thought that women were both morally and physically weak.'
To what extent do the sources you have studied support this statement? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- the laws relating to women
- Ischomachus
- Euphiletus
- the speech against Neaera
- the poisoning trial
- Aristophanes' Women at the Thesmophoria.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- women debarred from participating in political and legal processes; treated as an asset of the *oikos* and always under guardianship of *kurios* to be treated as seen fit by him; seduction seen as greater crime than rape in being greater threat to *oikos*; severe penalty for adultery (divorce plus banning from all public religious ceremonies, with possibility of any penalty short of death if disobeyed latter) doubtless intended to deter, but even severer penalties for men involved (*atimia* for husband who did not divorce adulterous wife, possibility though not necessity of death for adulterer) might suggest tendency to see woman as weaker victim in need of protection etc.
- Ischomachus: justifies indoor role he has assigned wife by reference to different characteristics god has given the sexes including women's relative physical weakness, and strongly objects to her wearing high boots / make-up because of anxiety about her attractiveness to other men, but through leader-bee analogy stresses the requirement for her to be assertive in management of internal matters of *oikos*, and emphasises what makes her sexually attractive and distinct from other women is her commanding supervisory role and physical fitness she gains from managing *oikos*; probably fictional dialogue in which Ischomachus' response determined by Socrates' initial question, and difficult to determine how far legitimate to generalise from this text etc.
- Euphiletus: in speech designed to win sympathy of jury of married men, says that at first kept an eye on her as was proper, perhaps out of fear of moral weakness but perhaps too because of her inexperience in running oikos to his satisfaction; all this changes on birth of son when his handing over of all his possessions and allowing her to sleep downstairs in relatively unprotected part of house suggests, if not affection, at least trust (and perhaps convenience for himself); not suspicious of moral weakness when wife left house in middle of night to get light and wore make-up soon after her brother's death; Eratosthenes, not wife, presented as villain, whose murder Euphiletus justifies as act of civic duty to protect integrity of state and oikos etc.
- Neaera: used by Apollodorus as a means of getting revenge on Stephanus, who is alleged to have used her and her daughter for his own ends; what Apollodorus has to say about Neaera hardly relevant to legitimate wives and, though Phrastor's divorce of Phano said to be partly because of her moral weakness, the critical issue is her status which throws into question legitimacy of child by him and, in case of Theogenes, leads to sacrilege in performance of rituals; Apollodorus rhetorically tries to persuade jury by appealing to their fear of wives' moral outrage if she is acquitted and distinction between wives and courtesans / prostitutes blurred etc.

- poisoning trial: in this case wife presented as scheming immoral villain akin to mythical Clytemnestra who tricks Philoneus' soon-to-be-ditched concubine to do her dirty work etc.
- Women at the Thesmophoria:
  - initial hymn parody of ritual at start of male assembly but includes curses on those who betray women (e.g. seducer who does not hand over promised gifts, barman who serves short measure), implying male anxieties of female weakness for sex / alcohol true
  - Mica's speech does not demonstrate Euripides' supposed allegations false, but that they have increased husbands' suspicions and so curtailed wives' activities; her attack on Mnesilochus more because of moral weaknesses he is revealing than its falsehood
  - women cannot deny Mnesilochus' guesses that women drank at previous Thesmophoria, again reinforcing their supposed weakness
  - incident with Mica's baby both allusion to women's alleged alcoholism and parody of *Telephus* as well as bizarre slapstick
  - parabasis: defence of women, criticism of male inconsistency and prurience, abuse of prominent Athenians (standard in comedy) by comparison with mainly fictitious women (though Salabaccho, model of virtue compared to Cleophon, apparently well-known whore), plea that women be honoured in accordance with son's service to Athens
  - parodies of Euripides' plays: Helen and Andromeda plays of rescue and romance in which eponymous heroines not villains but victims, physically but not morally weak
  - end of play: women quickly and inconsistently accept Euripides' deal, implying there is much he could reveal about their moral weakness etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

#### Option D

'Juvenal portrays women as more threatening to men than Aristophanes does.'

To what extent do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from Satire 6 and Women at the Thesmophoria.

#### You might include discussion of

- the circumstances in which each author was writing and the nature of each text
- the range of women's behaviour that Juvenal describes
- how vividly Juvenal writes
- the range of female behaviour in Women at the Thesmophoria
- the Chorus' and Chorus-Leader's views about women in the middle of the play
- the parodies of Euripides' tragedies
- the end of Women at the Thesmophoria.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.** 

- Juvenal: dramatic setting is giving advice to man about to marry; absurdly exaggerated negative satire (appropriate to a 'stag-night' context) with manic list of criticisms based on traditional male fears and stock jokes e.g. women's deceit, sexual depravity and deviousness (graphic descriptions of Eppia's and Messalina's extreme infidelities, of wife schooled by mother with lover in hiding, of women's ability to procure abortions and desirability of their doing so to avoid 'being the father of an Ethiopian') as well as meddling in men's affairs and attempting to humiliate them through litigiousness, athleticism, misuse of education by showing off learnedness at dinner parties; underlying all the stock views that poverty brings virtue and peace since Punic Wars has brought luxury, licentiousness and decadence; even Cornelia is to be feared because of her snobbery and only a peasant woman would bring contentment etc.
- Aristophanes' play for a male audience at a politically sensitive time; fantastical starting point of play: women debating Euripides' death at Thesmophoria for denigrating them in his plays, a charge which Mnesilochus claims is true; initial hymn parody of ritual at start of male assembly but includes curses on those who betray women (e.g. seducer who does not hand over promised gifts, barman who serves short measure), implying male anxieties of female obsession with sex / alcohol damaging to male interests of wellbeing of oikos true; Mica's speech does not demonstrate Euripides' supposed allegations false, but that have increased husbands' suspicions and so curtailed wives' subversive activities; her attack on Mnesilochus more because of what he is revealing rather than its falsehood; women cannot deny Mnesilochus' guesses that women drank at previous Thesmophoria, again playing on stereotypical joke of their bibulousness; incident with Mica's baby both allusion to women's alleged alcoholism and parody of Telephus; 2<sup>nd</sup> part of play dominated by parodies of Euripides' plays of rescue and romance Helen and Andromeda in which eponymous heroines not villains threatening males but victims in need of protection; Critylla's (and Scythian's) stupidity in failing to understand what is going on; end of play: women quickly and inconsistently accept Euripides' deal, implying there is much he could reveal, and cooperate in bamboozling Scythian (? allusion to *Iphiginia in Tauris / Cyclops*), thus undermining any serious criticisms of women there may have been etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

## Assessment Objectives Grid Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

#### Section 1

#### Either Option A

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
01	1	-	1
02	3	-	3
03	1	-	1
04	5	5	10
05	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

#### Or Option B

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
06	2	-	2
07	1	-	1
08	2	-	2
09	5	5	10
10	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

#### Section 2

#### Either Option C

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
11	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

### Or

#### Option D

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
12	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

#### **OVERALL**

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%